U4L1A5 | Debate

overview
This lesson will help students to develop and defend a personal opinion on one of the different development indicators. This will be done during a class debate.

learning goal
• Students will develop an understanding of how development is measured and assess which process is best suited for sustainability. They will also then formulate and defend an opinion on the topic.

success criteria
• Students will defend one development indicator in a debate over which is best for measuring the development of Venezuela.
• Students will complete an exit card assessing their learning and the best arguments from the debate.

Inquiry Question
• What is the best indicator to measure sustainable development in Venezuela?

Instructions:

Topic
The country of Venezuela has made great strides in overcoming poverty and access to social services. This is helping the country to develop. The government, however, realizes that the focus on social programs has caused there to be a lapse in progress towards sustainability. The government has decided that the focus must change to one of sustainable development. Research has informed the government that the use of the GDP as a means of measuring development is outdated and inappropriate. **In order to achieve sustainability, Venezuela must replace it with a form of measurement that includes a wider scope of criteria. In order to increase the overall sustainability of Venezuela the solution lies in…GPI, GNH, SPI or HPI.**

Format of debate:
This debate will take the format of a triangle debate. This means the class will be divided into 5 teams and a group of moderators (total 6 teams):
1. HPI—argue in favour of Happy Planet Index
2. GPI—argue in favour of Genuine Progress Indicator
3. GNH—argue in favour of Gross National Happiness
4. SSI—argue in favour of the Sustainable Society Index
5. SPI—argue in favour of Social Progress Index
6. Moderators—develop the questions that will determine the focus of the debate and run the debate.

The debate will be ordered as follows:
1. Opening Statement—2 minutes each side
2. Question period—2 questions per side = 8 questions total
3. Free debate (time permitting)
4. Closing statements—2 minutes per side

U4L1A5 | Debate

Structure of Debate:

i. Divide the class into five teams. Each team will have a relatively equal number of members.

ii. You may opt to give students class time to research and prepare their arguments or you may wish to have them prepare on their own at home.

iii. The questions from the moderators will be kept secret until the debate so teams must prepare a thorough understanding of their arguments in order to be able to argue their points effectively.

iv. Moderators will be in charge of running the debate, creating questions to challenge each side (three per side), evaluating the debate teams and at the end determine the winner of the debate and give constructive feedback to both sides. Give the moderators an idea of your expectations of how the debate is to run. If you wish them to follow certain timing or structures, please make that explicit to them

v. Debating teams will be responsible for preparing opening and closing statements and developing a body on knowledge that will allow them to answer the questions proposed by the Moderators.

vi. Inform students that team will hand in a bibliography of sources they used to develop their opinion.

vii. Rubrics for evaluation are offered in the handouts, but are a suggestion only.

viii. Offer students the following idea to contemplate as a source of focus as they research and prepare.

Think…what does your indicator offer that others cannot?

Evaluation debaters:

Criteria	Level 4	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1	Mark Assigned
Understanding • topic being debated	Student/side displayed thorough understanding of the topic being debated	Student/side displayed considerable understanding of the topic being debated	Student/side displayed some understanding of the topic being debated	Student/side displayed limited understanding of the topic being debated	___ /5 K/U
Critical thinking • quality of rebuttal	Rebuttal was highly effective	Rebuttal was effective	Rebuttal was somewhat effective	Rebuttal was ineffective	___ /5 T/I
• facts supporting argument	Student/side supported argument with many relevant facts	Student/side supported argument with relevant facts	Student/side supported argument with some relevant facts	Student/side supported argument with very few relevant facts or with irrelevant facts	___ /5 T/I
Communication • (oral)	Communicated orally with a great degree of effectiveness	Communicated orally with considerable effectiveness	Communicated orally with some effectiveness	Communicated orally with limited effectiveness	___ /5 Comm
Application • transfer of prior knowledge	Knowledge previously gained was transferred to the debate in a highly effective manner	Knowledge previously gained was transferred to the debate in an effective manner	Knowledge previously gained was transferred to the debate with moderate effectiveness	Knowledge previously gained was transferred to the debate with minimal effectiveness	___ /5 App
Overall achievement level & comments:					Mark: ___ /25

global system choices
unit four

U4L1A5 | Debate

Criteria	Level 4	Level 3	Level 2	Level 1	Mark Assigned
Knowledge/ Understanding • controlling ideas or themes	Showed a high degree of insight into key issues, ideas, or themes	Showed considerable insights into key issues, ideas, or themes	Showed some insights into key issues, ideas, or themes	Showed limited insights into key issues, ideas, or themes	___ /5
Thinking/ Inquiry • use of questions • critical listening	Provided highly effective, well-chosen questions to support ideas and arguments; showed a high degree of effectiveness in clarifying, questioning, and extending points made by others Showed a high degree of openness to judging to the ideas and opinions of others	Provided considerable, well-chosen questions to support ideas and arguments; showed considerable effectiveness in clarifying, questioning, and extending points made by others Showed considerable openness to judging to the ideas and opinions of others	Provided some relevant questions to support ideas and arguments; showed some effectiveness in clarifying, questioning, and extending points made by others Showed some openness to judging to the ideas and opinions of others	Provided limited relevant questions to support ideas and arguments; showed limited effectiveness in clarifying, questioning, and extending points made by others Showed limited openness to judging to the ideas and opinions of others	___ /5 ___ /5
Communication • rules for classroom debate	Followed rules of courteous classroom debate in all or almost all instances	Followed rules of courteous classroom debate in most instances	Followed rules of courteous classroom debate in some instances	Followed rules of courteous classroom debate in few instances	___ /5
Application • speech	Spoke with a high degree of clarity and effectiveness	Spoke with considerable clarity and effectiveness	Spoke with some clarity and effectiveness	Spoke with limited clarity and effectiveness	___ /5
Overall achievement level & comments:					Mark: ___ /30

U4L1A5 | Debate

Debater organizer:

A Opening statement:

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

B Supporting arguments:

1. _____

_____

_____

_____

2. _____

_____

_____

_____

3. _____

_____

_____

_____

4. _____

_____

_____

_____

U4L1A5 | Debate

C Arguments my opponents will make:

1. _____

2. _____

3. _____

D Counterpoints to arguments in part C.

1. _____

2. _____

3. _____

U4L1A5 | Debate

E Concluding remarks:

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

U4L1A5 | Debate

Moderators debate organizer:
The main job of the moderator is to control and run the debate. As moderators you will be in charge of:
- Start the debate on time
- Welcome everyone
- Introduce the topic to be discussed
- Determine the order of debate
- Remind participants to be respectful in demeanor and use of language
- Keep speakers to their allotted times and to focus on the issue at hand
- Thank everyone for attending
- Assess the arguments and behaviour of each side and decide on a winner
- What are the roles of each moderator during the debate?

What are the main arguments for each side?

Pros	Cons

What are the ideas you wish the debate to cover?

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

U4L1A5 | Debate

What are the questions you want to ask the opposing teams during the debate?
Questions for each team:

Team 1—HPI

1. _____

2. _____

Team 2—GPI

1. _____

2. _____

Team 3—GNH

1. _____

2. _____

Team 4—SPI

1. _____

2. _____

Things we will look for in our winning team:

_____

_____

_____

Infractions/errors to warn the teams about:

_____

_____

global system choices
unit four

U4L1A5 | **Debate**

Who is in charge of the following?

Timing the debate

_____

Issuing warnings re: infractions

_____

Delivering our verdict

_____

All members must read a minimum of one question or present the overall verdict on the debate. This ensures that all team members present at some point during the debate.

U4L1A5 | Debate

Debate Topic: **Name:**

Debate Exit Card
Complete the following questions and hand in your card to gain exit to the free world.

1. What were the strongest arguments made? List and explain two.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

2. List some (two–three) ideas you learned about this topic.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

3. What is something that made you go hmmmm (i.e., you found interesting)? Explain.

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

U4L1A5 | Debate

Development indicators
Debate team lists

Moderators	GPI	GNH	HPI	SPI	SSI

This debate will take the format of a triangle debate.
This means the class will be divided into three teams and a group of moderators:

1. HPI—argue in favour of Happy Planet Index
2. GPI—argue in favour of Genuine Progress Indicator
3. GNH—argue in favour of Gross National Happiness
4. SPI—argue in favour of Social Progress Index
5. SSI—argue in favour of the Sustainable Society Index
6. Moderators—develop the questions that will determine the focus of the debate and run the debate.

Debate will take place _____